

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28

IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT

FOR THE NORTHERN DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA

VALERIE D. WATSON-SMITH,

Plaintiff,

No. C 07-05774 JSW

v.

SPHERION PACIFIC WORKFORCE, LLC.,

Defendant.

**ORDER DENYING OBJECTION
AND AFFIRMING THE
DISCOVERY ORDER**

Now before the Court is the objection filed by Defendant to Magistrate Judge Brazil's Discovery Order dated April 10, 2009 (the "Discovery Order"). Having carefully reviewed the objection and considered Defendant's arguments and the relevant legal authority, and good cause appearing, the Court hereby DENIES Defendant's objections and AFFIRMS the Discovery Order.

The District Court may modify or set aside any portion of a magistrate's ruling on non-dispositive pre-trial motions found to be "clearly erroneous or contrary to law." Fed. R. Civ. P. 72(a); *see also, e.g., Grimes v. City and County of San Francisco*, 951 F.2d 236, 241 (9th Cir. 1991). A ruling is clearly erroneous if the reviewing court, after considering the evidence, is left with the "definite and firm conviction that a mistake has been committed." *United States v. U.S. Gypsum Co.*, 333 U.S. 364, 395 (1948).

///
///
///

1 After a careful review of the Discovery Order, this Court finds that the Judge Brazil's
2 ruling was not clearly erroneous or contrary to law. Therefore, this Court DENIES Defendant's
3 Objections and AFFIRMS the Discovery Order dated April 10, 2009.

4 **IT IS SO ORDERED.**

5
6 Dated: April 23, 2009


7 _____
8 _____
9 _____
10 _____
11 _____
12 _____
13 _____
14 _____
15 _____
16 _____
17 _____
18 _____
19 _____
20 _____
21 _____
22 _____
23 _____
24 _____
25 _____
26 _____
27 _____
28 _____

JEFFREY S. WHITE
UNITED STATES DISTRICT JUDGE